

**GMCA AND AGMA SCRUTINY POOL**

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON FRIDAY 9 OCTOBER 2015  
AT MANCHESTER TOWN HALL**

**PRESENT**

Manchester CC	Cllr Ahmed Ali Cllr Angeliki Stogia Cllr Matt Strong
Oldham MBC	Cllr Cath Ball Cllr Colin McLaren
Rochdale MBC	Cllr Neil Butterworth
Salford CC	Cllr John Ferguson Cllr John Walsh
Stockport MBC	Cllr Susan Ingham Cllr John McGahan
Tameside MBC	Cllr John Bell Cllr Gill Peet
Trafford MBC:	Cllr Barry Brotherton Cllr Pam Dixon
Wigan MBC	Cllr John O'Brien (Chair) Cllr Pam Stewart

**IN ATTENDANCE**

Interim Mayor	Tony Lloyd
Planning & Housing and Low Carbon Portfolio Lead	Cllr Sue Derbyshire
Transport Portfolio Lead	Cllr Jim McMahon
Chair, TfGMC	Cllr Andrew Fender
Low Carbon Portfolio Lead	Steve Rumbelow
Planning & Housing Portfolio Lead	Eamonn Boylan
GM PSR Team	Andrew Lightfoot
GM Planning & Housing Team	Anne Morgan
TfGM	Steve Warrener
TfGM	Des Gardner
GMIST	Julie Connor
	Susan Ford
	Kerry Bond

**15/40 APOLOGIES**

Apologies were received from Cllrs Anne Graham (Bolton); Andrew Morgan (Bolton); Ian Bevan (Bury); Jane Black (Bury); Julia Turner (Oldham); Robert Clegg (Rochdale); Jillian Collinson (Salford); Wendy Wild (Stockport); Maria Bailey (Tameside); Jonathan Coupe (Trafford); Edward Houlton (Wigan).

**15/41 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

There were no declarations of interest made in respect of any item on the agenda.

**15/42 MINUTES OF THE GMCA AND AGMA SCRUTINY POOL MEETING HELD ON 10 JULY 2015**

The minutes of the GMCA and AGMA Scrutiny Pool meeting held on 10 July were submitted for consideration.

**RESOLVED/-**

To approve the minutes of the GMCA and AGMA Scrutiny Pool meeting held on 10 July 2015.

**15/43 GREATER MANCHESTER DEVOLUTION A PLACE-BASED APPROACH**

Tony Lloyd, Interim Mayor thanked Members for the opportunity to attend the meeting before introducing a presentation detailing the future vision for GM, detailing-

- changes required to deliver outcomes for communities
- opportunities and assets: commitment to devolution and Northern Powerhouse relationships with partners, improving infrastructure, research and development
- challenges within communities
- capacity to deliver and to make a difference
- legitimacy: accountability, transparency, increased scrutiny

Andrew Lightfoot, Greater Manchester Director for Public Service Reform gave a presentation including-

- key milestones
- challenges
- priorities
- opportunities
- proposals as part of the 2015 Spending Review

**Questions and comments from the Scrutiny Pool included-*****Q. How can local Councillors be included in devolution?***

A. The ten Greater Manchester Leaders have portfolio responsibilities, it is important that councillors are aware of areas of work undertaken by Leaders. Local Councillors have

a key role to actively champion and explain the work of the Scrutiny Pool to district colleagues, local partners and the public.

**Q. Are there any proposals to reform transport for public/patient to appointments and/or their work place?**

- A. As part of the Devolution agreement the Elected Mayor (from 2017) can re-regulate bus services to ensure better connectivity. Currently TfGM work with providers of Patient Transfer Services to ensure effective coordination.

**Q. Will the devolution agreement give more support to students who wish to pursue practical subjects?**

- A. This is an aspiration, there is currently no alignment between education and the skills system, currently Greater Manchester has no responsibility for education provision for students under 19 years of age.

**Q. Business Rates: There is an issue in small town centres, will there be a provision to acknowledge this?**

- A. There will be an equalisation opportunity over the next 20 years to look at Business Rates Reform.
- C. The Interim Mayor was very supportive of the role of the viewing them as fundamental to society and mobilising goodwill to local levels.

**RESOLVED/-**

1. To note the presentations.
2. That regular updates be brought to Scrutiny Pool.

**15/44 GM CLIMATE CHANGE AND LOW EMISSIONS IMPLEMENTATION PLAN  
2016-2020**

Cllr Sue Derbyshire, Chair, Greater Manchester Low Carbon Hub Board, Steve Rumbelow, Chief Executive Portfolio Holder for Low Carbon and Mark Atherton, Greater Manchester Director of Environment introduced a report and presentation, providing members with an overview of the development of the draft Implementation Plan for the GM Climate Change Strategy and Low Emission Strategies, including the current version of a Consultation Report and the proposed consultation pathway.

**Questions and comments from the Scrutiny Pool included-**

**Q. How do we know / find out about things like the current Volkswagen emission scandal that affects CO2 emissions, and how do we stop them?**

- A. The Greater Manchester Low Carbon Hub team work closely with TfGM on issues such as carbon emissions.

**C. Greater Manchester future drives carbon reduction, this agenda needs to be taken into primary schools, businesses etc to educate on recycling etc.**

**Q. Are there any targets for intermediate years up to 2020?**

- A. There aren't any targets year on year targets, as they only become available 18 months later eg 2015 targets are received on 2016-2017. Data is out of date when

received and is variable dependant on seasons. Interim targets can be included for future data.

**Q. Do we have data for the 'current gap' 1.68Mt, shown in the wedges data, and are the European Union being consulted?**

- A. There is a consultation process to gain data, contact will be made with the European Parliament and report back on a future update.

**RESOLVED/-**

1. To endorse the consultation version of the Implementation Plan, detailed as annex 1 of the report.
2. To note that the funding for the delivery of our low carbon investment ambitions are the subject of a Comprehensive Spending review bid to Government.
3. To receive a further update at the Scrutiny Pool meeting scheduled for 15 January 2016.
4. Interim targets for intermediate years up to 2020 will be plotted and included in the update to the January meeting.
5. That the Low Carbon Team will liaise with the European Parliament to access data to complete the wedges data.

**15/45 GREATER MANCHESTER SPATIAL FRAMEWORK**

Cllr Sue Derbyshire, Chair, Greater Manchester Planning and Housing Commission and Eamonn Boylan, Chief Executive Portfolio Holder for Planning and Housing presented a report updating members on the progress and next steps with the Greater Manchester Spatial Framework, outlining the next consultation stage scheduled for November 2015. A significant amount of work has been undertaken to articulate our ambition and extend the evidence base, the consultation will outline the further work we have undertaken to understand the impact of devolution and the Northern Powerhouse and will also set out the following-

- GM 'Vision' and strategic outcomes;
- Proposed strategy/strategic objectives;
- Potential growth 'options' that the GMSF could seek to deliver based on economic forecasting and demographic modelling work we have undertaken.
- A 'Call for Sites'
- Assessment of the options using our Integrated Assessment framework

**Questions and comments from the Scrutiny Pool included-**

**Q. Won't the consultation generate very different places across Greater Manchester?**

- A. This consultation will not get to the level of identification of sites, but will detail the capacity to accommodate a realistic level of growth required for Greater Manchester, this will then be broke down by borough and then again by area/ward.
- C. Detailed local authority briefings have been prepared and are available from individual district Lead Members, Chief Executives or Planning Officers.

***Q. Rather than modelling three scenarios, should we not be considering the medium/high figures from the Greater Manchester Forecasting Model?***

- A. The forecasting model produces a low growth scenario, and doesn't take into account the Northern Powerhouse, Devolution, migration variables etc, we are using the model as a bedrock and building from this to develop the three scenarios.

**RESOLVED/-**

1. To note the report.
2. To receive a further report on the consultation document at the Scrutiny Pool meeting scheduled for 11 December 2015.
3. That the GMSF team liaise with local authorities to ensure that all local members receive consultation detail.

**15/46 SMART TICKETING IN GREATER MANCHESTER**

Following a request from Scrutiny Pool members, Cllr Jim McMahon, Lead Portfolio Holder for Transport, Steve Warrener and Des Gardener from TfGM provided an update on the implementation of Smart Ticketing in Greater Manchester. Cllr Andrew Fender, Chair TfGMC also attended the meeting for this item.

TfGM contracted Atos in 2012 to design, build and operate a smart ticketing system for Greater Manchester. After a considerable delay it became clear that the smart ticketing system could not be delivered as contracted, following negotiation the parties agreed a mutual termination of the contract on commercial terms. This has resulted in TfGM recovering all of its costs relating to the smart ticketing project. The terms of the agreement as detailed in Sections 2 and 3 of the report, will enable TfGM to develop a smart ticketing system with alternative providers and establish alternative arrangements for smart ticketing on Metrolink. A number of short term alternative options have been explored, for example Smart Phone Mobile Ticketing and Contactless Payments on current Ticket Vending Machines.

A 'Smart on Bus' ticket system will be implemented by the end of 2015, with a smart ticketing for heavy rail being included in the rail franchising process, due to commence in April 2016.

**Questions and comments from the Scrutiny Pool included-**

***Q. What are the penalties to Atos for failing to deliver the contract?***

- A. The Atos contract and due diligence was robust, background checks were carried out and the process was managed appropriately but they were unable to demonstrate deliverability of functionality required in Greater Manchester. Atos lost significant amounts of funding in result of losing the contract. It was also confirmed that GM residents were not "out of pocket" as a result of the termination of the contract, although there was lost opportunity costs.

***Q. Going forwards are you confident on the dates detailed in the report for live smart ticketing for buses and rail.***

- A. The smart phone app and the 'Smart on Bus' ticketing will be live by the end of 2015. Following a request from the DfT, rail franchise bidders have made a commitment to work with TfGM on a range of subjects including smart ticketing which are due to

commence in April 2016. A consultation will take place across Greater Manchester by the end of the year.

**Q. How will lessons learned be incorporated in any future contract, and will devolution give further opportunities for this project. For example, paying for a complex system that is obsolete 2 years later due to deregulation**

A. We are looking at a platform of payment methods for individuals, that is the most cost effective, offers best value for money and sustainable over the longer term offering a system that will work best for residents. Lessons learned will inform future contract arrangements.

**C. Members asked that their concern on the position of and the progress made on the smart ticketing contract with Atos be recorded, especially the fact that the situation had been allowed to continue for a period of 3 years. It was noted that their was to be a continuing review, they commended the recovery of the money and asked to be regularly updated on future progress.**

#### **RESOLVED/-**

1. To note the current position in relation to the Smart Ticketing Programme.
2. To note the progress made in relation to the next steps including, in particular, the Metrolink Transition Plan and the shorter term roll out plan.
3. This Scrutiny Pool be regularly updated on progress.

#### **15/47 SCRUTINY POOL WORK PROGRAMME 2015/16**

#### **RESOLVED/-**

To agree to receive the items detailed on the work programme for the meeting scheduled for 13 November 2015.

#### **15/48 SCHEDULE OF MEETINGS 2015/16**

The schedule of meetings for 2015/16 was agreed as-

13 November 2015  
 11 December 2015  
 15 January 2016  
 12 February 2016  
 11 March 2016  
 8 April 2016  
 10 June 20106

All meetings will be held 1:00pm - 3:00pm at Manchester Town Hall

Chair